

# Evolution and extinction of the giant rhinoceros Elasmotherium sibiricum sheds light on late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions

Pavel Kosintsev, Kieren J. Mitchell, Thibaut Deviese, Johannes van Der Plicht, Margot Kuitems, Ekaterina Petrova, Alexei Tikhonov, Thomas Higham, Daniel Comeskey, Chris Turney, et al.

### ▶ To cite this version:

Pavel Kosintsev, Kieren J. Mitchell, Thibaut Deviese, Johannes van Der Plicht, Margot Kuitems, et al.. Evolution and extinction of the giant rhinoceros Elasmotherium sibiricum sheds light on late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions. Nature Ecology & Evolution, 2019, 3 (1), pp.31-38. 10.1038/s41559-018-0722-0. hal-03207788

## HAL Id: hal-03207788 https://amu.hal.science/hal-03207788v1

Submitted on 28 Apr 2021

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

Evolution and extinction of the giant rhinoceros Elasmotherium 1 2 sibiricum sheds light on late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions Pavel Kosintsev<sup>1</sup>, Kieren J. Mitchell<sup>2</sup>, Thibaut Devièse<sup>3</sup>, Johannes van der Plicht<sup>4,5</sup>, Margot Kuitems<sup>4,5</sup>, 3 Ekaterina Petrova<sup>6</sup>, Alexei Tikhonov<sup>6</sup>, Thomas Higham<sup>3</sup>, Daniel Comeskey<sup>3</sup>, Chris Turney<sup>7</sup>, Alan 4 Cooper<sup>2</sup>, Thijs van Kolfschoten<sup>5</sup>, Anthony J Stuart<sup>8</sup>, Adrian M Lister<sup>9\*</sup>. 5 <sup>1</sup>Institute of Plant and Animal Ecology, Ural Branch, Russian Academy of Sciences, 8 Marta St. 202, 6 Yekaterinburg 620144, Russia 7 <sup>2</sup> Australian Centre for Ancient DNA, School of Biological Sciences, University of Adelaide, North 8 9 Terrace Campus, South Australia 5005, Australia 10 <sup>3</sup>Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit, University of Oxford, 1-2 South Parks Road, Oxford, OX1 3TG, 11 UK 12 <sup>4</sup> Center for Isotope Research, Groningen University, Groningen, The Netherlands <sup>5</sup> Faculty of Archaeology, Leiden University, P.O. Box 9514, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands 13 14 <sup>6</sup> Zoological Institute, Russian Academy of Sciences, 1 Universitetskaya Naberezhnaya, St. 15 Petersburg, 199034, Russia 16 <sup>7</sup>Palaeontology, Geobiology and Earth Archives Research Centre, and Climate Change Research 17 Centre, School of Biological, Earth, and Environmental Sciences, University of New South Wales, 18 Sydney, Australia. <sup>8</sup> Department of Biosciences, Durham University, South Road, Durham DH1 3LE, UK 19 20 <sup>9</sup> Department of Earth Sciences, Natural History Museum, London SW7 5BD, UK 21 22 \* Author for correspondence: A.Lister@nhm.ac.uk 23 24 Understanding extinction events requires an unbiased record of the chronology and ecology of 25 victims and survivors. The rhinoceros Elasmotherium sibiricum, known as the 'Siberian unicorn', 26 was believed to have gone extinct around 200 ka, well before the Late Quaternary megafaunal 27 extinction event. However, no absolute dating, genetic analysis, or quantitative ecological 28 assessment of this species has been undertaken. Here we show, by AMS radiocarbon dating of 23 29 individuals, including cross-validation by compound specific analysis, that E. sibiricum survived in 30 Eastern Europe and Central Asia until at least 39 ka BP, corroborating a wave of megafaunal 31 turnover prior to the Last Glacial Maximum in Eurasia, in addition to the better-known Late-glacial 32 event. Stable isotope data indicate a dry steppe niche for *E. sibiricum* and, together with 33 morphology, a highly specialised diet that likely contributed to its extinction. We further 34 demonstrate, with DNA sequence data, a very deep phylogenetic split between the subfamilies 35 Elasmotheriinae and Rhinocerotinae that includes all the living rhinos, settling a debate based on 36 fossil evidence and confirming that the two lineages had diverged by the Eocene. As the last 37 surviving member of the Elasmotheriinae, the demise of the 'Siberian unicorn' marked the 38 extinction of this subfamily.

39

40 The rhinoceros family (Rhinocerotidae) was formerly much more diverse than it is today, with some 41 250 named species<sup>1</sup> of which only five survive. During the Miocene (ca. 23-5 Ma), rhinos were a 42 dominant part of the large mammal fauna in Africa, Eurasia, and North America. Phylogenetic 43 analysis of fossil species has resolved two main lineages: the Rhinocerotinae, which includes all living 44 species and the recently-extinct woolly rhinoceros (Coelodonta antiquitatis), and the extinct 45 Elasmotheriinae<sup>2</sup>. Based on morphological diagnoses of early remains, the two subfamilies are thought to have diverged very early in rhinoceros evolution, by at latest 35 Ma<sup>2,3</sup>. The 46 47 Elasmotheriinae subsequently gave rise to some 20 genera, of which only Elasmotherium survived 48 the Miocene, with E. sibiricum its last surviving member, although some authors have separated 49 *Elasmotherium* from other members of the group and place it within Rhinocerotinae<sup>4,5</sup>. A 50 spectacular megafaunal species of Eurasia, at ca. 3.5 tonnes, E. sibiricum was the largest Quaternary 51 rhinoceros. E. sibiricum was also remarkable in its anatomy: relatively slender limbs indicating 52 adaptation for running, despite its mass<sup>6</sup>; absence of incisors and canines; and – uniquely among 53 rhinos – continuously-growing cheek-teeth with distinctive, highly convoluted enamel plates. The 54 presence of a massive single horn in *Elasmotherium* has been inferred from the bony protuberance 55 on the frontal bone of the skull which implies a horn base much larger than in any other rhino, living or extinct; hence the informal name 'Siberian unicorn' (Fig. 1). The known geographical ranges of 56 57 both E. sibiricum and related (in some cases possibly synonymous) Elasmotherium species were very limited, with most confirmed records from Kazakhstan, western and central Russia, Ukraine, 58 59 Azerbaijan, Uzbekistan, as well as isolated finds (referred to E. caucasicum) from Mongolia and 60 China<sup>2,7,8</sup> (Fig. 2). *E. sibiricum* was thought to have become extinct by 200,000 years ago, although 61 recent, unconfirmed reports suggested that it might have persisted into the Late Pleistocene<sup>7,9</sup>. Its 62 ecological niche has been a matter of speculation, from grazing on dry steppes to foraging for roots in damp riverine environments<sup>7</sup>. 63

#### 64 Results

Direct dating of unambiguously identified remains is an essential prerequisite for determining the 65 extinction chronology of late Quaternary megafauna<sup>10</sup>. Of a total of 25 *Elasmotherium sibiricum* 66 bone samples analysed in the present study, 23 contained sufficient collagen for radiocarbon dating 67 68 (Supplementary Table 1, Fig. 3). All samples were first dated by Accelerator Mass Spectrometry 69 (AMS) either at the Groningen Centre for Isotope Research (CIO), Netherlands (lab code GrA) or at 70 the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit (ORAU), UK (lab code OxA) using the routine procedures 71 (See Methods). All nine samples yielding dates younger than 35,000 radiocarbon years were then 72 cross-dated by the other laboratory (Supplementary Table 1), and the results were compared using a 73 chi-squared test (Supplementary Table 8). In five of nine cases, the pairs of dates were not 74 statistically distinguishable. For the other four paired samples, however, there was a discrepancy 75 between the dates obtained in the two laboratories. In two cases the dates obtained in Oxford were 76 older than those obtained in Groningen, in the other two cases the opposite was the case. These 77 differences are likely due to contamination which could not be totally removed using standard 78 methods of collagen purification. For two samples (IPAE 897/123 and ZIN 36330), the difference 79 between the dates obtained by the two laboratories was ~10,000 years. It was therefore decided to 80 undertake further dating of all nine samples using the single amino acid radiocarbon method 81 developed at the ORAU<sup>11</sup>. This method involves the separation of the underivatised amino acids 82 from hydrolysed bone collagen using preparative High Performance Liquid Chromatography (Prep-

83 HPLC), isolating the amino acid hydroxyproline for AMS measurement. This pretreatment approach 84 (coded 'HYP') is the most efficient available technique to remove contaminants including, but not limited to, conservation materials (with the exception of collagen-based glue). All of the 85 86 chronometric data from ORAU is reported in Supplementary Table 7. Chi-squared tests showed that 87 in four of the cases, the dates obtained on ultrafiltered collagen and hydroxyproline are not 88 statistically distinguishable (Supplementary Table 8), indicating that all the contaminant had been 89 removed by the AF/AF\* treatment (see Methods). In the other five cases, the dates obtained on 90 hydroxyproline are older than those obtained on collagen both in Groningen and Oxford. For these 91 five samples, we suspect that some contaminant had remained in the collagen (possibly crosslinked 92 to it) but was removed by hydrolysing the collagen and isolating hydroxyproline. Similar 93 observations have been made on a range of contaminated Palaeolithic bone samples (see, for example, refs. <sup>12–16</sup>). Ages obtained on hydroxyproline were therefore retained over those obtained 94 from bulk collagen on these nine samples. In the final dataset of conventional radiocarbon ages 95 96 (CRA), 19 are finite dates and 5 are beyond the radiocarbon limit. The five youngest ages are all 97 corroborated by HYP. The 19 finite dates were then calibrated against the IntCal13 dataset<sup>17</sup> using OxCal version 4.3<sup>18</sup> (Supplementary Fig. 2), and were incorporated within a single Phase model in 98 99 OxCal v.4.3 (Supplementary Table 9). We used a General outlier model (prior probability set at 0.05)<sup>19</sup> to explore the degree to which likelihoods were outlying. Using IntCal13, the calibrated 100 101 95.4% confidence intervals for the finite ages range in an overlapping series from 50-44.76 to 38.97-102 36.52 cal ka BP (Fig. 3, Supplementary Fig. 2). The end boundary in the model provides an estimate 103 of the last appearance of *Elasmotherium* at 38.48-35.06 cal ka BP (at 95.4% probability). Our data 104 demonstrate the late Quaternary extinction of E. sibiricum, and imply an extinction before the Last 105 Glacial Maximum. With 23 dates this conclusion is provisional, but it is supported by the lack of any known remains in dated post-LGM contexts<sup>20,21</sup>. 106

107 Six bone samples were subjected to ancient DNA analysis and all yielded usable DNA data, although 108 molecular preservation varied markedly (Supplementary Table 2). We were able to reconstruct a 109 high-quality mitochondrial genome sequence for the best-preserved specimen – IPAE915/2804 110 (GenBank accession: MH937513) – with a mean read-depth of 116.1×, which covered 99.3% of the 111 modern white rhinoceros reference (Ceratotherium simum, NC 001808). It is notable that 112 IPAE915/2804, from Tobolsk (latitude ~58°), is the most northerly of our samples (Fig. 2), possibly 113 accounting for its better DNA preservation. Despite poorer preservation in the other samples – as 114 low as 0.8× depth for 2388/1 – all sequences were very similar to IPAE915/2804 (≥99.7% identical at 115 unambiguously called nucleotide sites).

- Phylogenetic analyses including the IPAE915/2804 consensus sequence strongly suggest that
- 117 *Elasmotherium* is sister-taxon to Rhinocerotinae (Fig. 4; Maximum Likelihood Bootstrap, MLB = 99%,
- 118Bayesian Posterior Probability, BPP = 1.0). Relationships among perissodactyls were otherwise
- concordant with the results of past molecular studies<sup>22,23</sup>, although the position of the root of
   Rhinocerotinae remains poorly resolved.
- 121
- 122 Our molecular dating analyses suggest that the divergence between *Elasmotherium* and the
- 123 Rhinocerotinae occurred around 47.3 Ma (95% Highest Posterior Density, HPD = 41.9 53.2 Ma).
- 124 The primary divergence within crown Rhinocerotinae (the split between *Diceros+Ceratotherium* and
- the remaining taxa) occurred 30.8 Ma (95% HPD = 26.5 35.3 Ma), while the divergence of
- 126 Rhinocerotoidea from Tapiroidea occurred 57.5 Ma (95% HPD = 52.6 62.8 Ma). Highest Posterior

Densities (HPDs) for node ages estimated in the present study overlapped with those of comparable
 nodes in previously published studies<sup>23,24</sup>. However, our mean age estimates for nodes deeper in the
 tree (i.e. crown ages of Perissodactyla and Ceratomorpha) were slightly older than those in
 previously published studies, as our conservative node age constraints allowed for the possibility
 that perissodactyl diversification began during the Palaeocene (see Supplementary Information).

132

133 For stable isotope analysis, C:N ratios of all samples were within acceptable range (Supplementary 134 Table 6), with the exception of sample IPAE 420-111 which is just outside the range and is excluded from further discussion. The *Elasmotherium*  $\delta^{13}$ C values (n=22) range from -21.5‰ to -16.3‰ with a 135 mean of -18.1 ±0.3 ‰. The  $\delta^{15}$ N values (n=21) range from +6.5‰ to +12.8‰ with a mean of +9.4 136 137  $\pm 0.3 \%$  (Fig. 5; Supplementary Table 6). The range of stable isotope values might partly be due to geographic or temporal variation, although no trend through time or a correlation with latitude is 138 observed in the data (Supplementary Fig. 1). However, the *Elasmotherium*  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values 139 clearly differ from those of other fossil Rhinocerotidae from Eurasia (Fig. 5). The majority of E. 140 141 sibiricum individuals are relatively higher in both  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N than narrow-nosed and/or Merck's rhinoceros (Stephanorhinus hemitoechus/kirchbergensis) from the Middle Pleistocene of 142 Schöningen, Germany. Most of our samples are also enriched in both  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N than woolly 143 144 rhinoceros (Coelodonta antiquitatis) from within the temporal and geographical range of the 145 Elasmotherium material. Conversely, E. sibiricum overlaps strongly with a sample of saiga antelope 146 (Saiga tatarica) from the same spatio-temporal range (Fig. 5).

147

#### 148 Discussion

149 Our results have implications for both the phylogenetic position and extinction of the last

- elasmotheriine rhinoceros, and for the pattern and causality of Late Quaternary megafaunal
- 151 turnover. The deep division between *Elasmotherium sibiricum* and the extant rhinoceroses in our
- 152 molecular phylogeny (Fig. 4) is strongly supportive of an ancient split between Elasmotheriinae
- 153 (including *Elasmotherium*, contra refs. <sup>4,5</sup>) and Rhinocerotinae, in keeping with recent
- 154 palaeontological evidence: the earliest fossil species referred to Elasmotheriinae are Subhyracodon
- 155 *occidentalis* and *Penetrigonias dakotensis* at ca. 38 Ma<sup>3,25</sup>, while the earliest certain representative
- 156 of Rhinocerotinae is *Epiaceratherium naduongense*<sup>26</sup> at ca. 39-35 Ma. Our early- to mid-Eocene
- 157 estimate of ~47.4 Ma for the divergence between Elasmotheriinae and Rhinocerotinae pre-dates
- their first fossil appearances by 8-9 Ma, with this lag likely explained by the incompleteness of
- taxonomic samples included in morphology-based phylogenetic analyses of Rhinocerotidae,
- 160 especially regarding stem Eocene taxa<sup>2,3</sup>.
- 161 Previously, the loss of *E. sibiricum* has been regarded as part of the 'background extinction' of large 162 mammals that proceeded through the Early and Middle Pleistocene. The species was considered 163 typical of the Singhil and Khazar faunistic complexes of Russia, broadly early and late Middle 164 Pleistocene, respectively, with its youngest occurrences attributed to the late Middle Pleistocene, ca. 200 ka<sup>7,8</sup>. However, most of the remains, from locations in the Volga region, were found on river 165 banks, with likely mixing of bones from different geological horizons. On the basis of locally 166 167 associated faunas, a possible Late Pleistocene age for some of the remains had been suggested (refs. 168 <sup>9</sup>, and <sup>2</sup>, p.42, but except for Smelovskaya II these specimens were also recovered *ex situ* and all 169 radiocarbon dates on associated fauna are infinite (Supplementary Information). A radiocarbon

170 measurement of 26,038 ± 356 BP (UBA-30522) was obtained from a partial skull of *E. sibiricum* from

171 Kozhamzhar, Kazakhstan<sup>27</sup>, but the context otherwise appeared Middle Pleistocene, and the

172 laboratory indicated that the date was unreliable as collagen yield was only 0.3% after

173 ultrafiltration<sup>28</sup>.

174 Our results therefore provide reliably dated Late Pleistocene occurrences of E. sibiricum ranging from close to the older limit of radiocarbon dating to just before the onset of Greenland Stadial 8 175 (ca. 36-35 cal ka BP: ref.<sup>29</sup>). This places its extinction firmly within the Late Quaternary extinction 176 event, during which approximately 40% of northern Eurasian mammal species with body weights 177 >45 kg (megafauna) died out in the interval ca. 50-4 ka<sup>30</sup>. Many of these species became extinct in 178 the Late-glacial (GI-1 & GS-1) and Holocene (MIS 1), starting from ca. 15 cal ka BP. The latest dates 179 180 for E. sibiricum around 39-35 ka, however, form an important addition to the growing evidence for 181 turnover in the northern Eurasian large mammal fauna before or early in the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM)<sup>31,32</sup>. The LGM has been variously defined, including the minimum in  $\delta^{18}$ O in Greenland ice ca. 182 30-25 ka (Fig. 3), or the minimum sea level and maximum expansion of northern hemisphere ice 183 sheets ca. 21 ka<sup>33,34</sup>. The latest dates for *E. sibiricum* are closely coincident with those for *Homo* 184 neanderthalensis and the east Beringian stilt-legged horse Haringtonhippus francisci<sup>32,35,36</sup>. This was 185 followed by apparent peripheral range reduction in *C. antiquitatis*<sup>32,37</sup>, and major genetic turnover in 186 several species including mammoth and bison<sup>32</sup>. The latest records of Eurasian spotted hyaena C. 187 crocuta and cave bear U. spelaeus are at ca. 31 ka and 28-27 ka, respectively<sup>38-41</sup>, while 188

Megaloceros giganteus suffered major range collapse, recovering only in the Late-glacial (GI-1)<sup>42</sup>.
 The available dates for *E. sibiricum* strongly corroborate this pre-LGM phase of faunal turnover.
 There are many fossil localities within the sampled geographical area that have produced later dates
 for other megafauna<sup>20,43</sup>, so the absence of *Elasmotherium* is unlikely to be due to lack of suitable
 assemblages.

194 The inferred timing of these events falls during a period of pronounced climate and environmental

195 change, the series of Greenland Stadials and Interstadials that characterised Marine Isotope Stage

196 3<sup>32</sup>. The start of the dated faunal events, including the last appearance of *E. sibiricum*, are

approximately coincident with GS-8 and Heinrich stadial 4, a major episode of ice rafting into the

198 North Atlantic<sup>44</sup>. Plant, insect and lithostratigraphic proxies from across northern Eurasia

199 corroborate a sustained shift to cold tundra-steppe beginning around 35 ka <sup>14</sup>C BP (equivalent to 40-

200 38 ka), with the breakup of grass/herb-dominated vegetation cover<sup>45</sup>. These changes are a potential

201 contributor to the turnover and extinction of large mammals in the interval preceding the LGM, but

202 further data are required to examine their regional effects in areas such as the central Asian range of

203 E. sibiricum.

204 The extinction of *Elasmotherium* may also have been linked to its high degree of specialisation,

205 including extreme dietary adaptations<sup>7</sup>. Among other rhinoceros species, morphological and tooth-

206 wear data show that S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus were browse- and graze-dominated

207 mixed-feeders, respectively, while *C. antiquitatis* was a grazer<sup>46–49</sup>. In *E. sibiricum* the obtuse angle

208 between the plane of the occiput and the palate indicates that the head was carried lower even than

in the woolly rhinoceros and the living white rhino<sup>50,51</sup>, an extreme adaptation to feeding close to the

210 ground. The hypsodont, rootless, permanently-growing cheek teeth, with highly convoluted enamel,

211 imply hypergrazing adaptation and/or the consumption of substantial quantities of dust or grit. Our

212 stable isotope analyses of *E. sibiricum* also show values clearly differing from those of other

- 213 rhinoceros species (Fig. 5). Pollen, plant macrofossil and faunal data suggest that during MIS 3, the
- areas inhabited by *E. sibiricum* included open steppe habitats in the southern Trans-Urals, while in
- 215 other areas forest-steppe landscapes with extensive grassy areas were present<sup>52</sup>. High  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N
- values, seen in *E. sibiricum*, are typical for mammals inhabiting a dry steppe or desert biotope<sup>53</sup>. The
- $\delta^{13}$ C values of *E. sibiricum* may also have been influenced by the consumption of Chenopodiaceae
- 218 (C4 photosynthesisers), as in modern saiga antelope Saiga tatarica<sup>54</sup>, and/or to the pulling up and
- consumption of roots (as suggested for *E. sibiricum*<sup>7</sup>), since non-photosynthetic plant parts tend to be elevated in  $\delta^{13}$ C (ref. <sup>55</sup>).
- 221

222 Previous stable isotope studies on mammalian herbivore species from Europe have illustrated change in ecological niches during the pre-LGM<sup>56</sup> and the Late glacial<sup>57</sup>. Both *C. antiquitatis* and *S.* 223 tatarica survived the extinction of E. sibiricum, the former with an isotopic signature implying a 224 dietary niche consistently different from that of E. sibiricum, the latter with a shift in its range of 225 226 isotopic values. While Saiga samples from pre-LGM central Asia show  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values overlapping strongly with contemporary *Elasmotherium* (Fig. 5), samples from later periods (LGM to 227 Late-glacial Interstadial, GI-1), and those from other regions, include lower  $\delta^{15}$ N values (down to +2.8 228 ‰), indicating dietary flexibility<sup>54</sup>. The implication is that both *Coelodonta* and *Saiga* could cope with 229 230 the environmental change that began around 38 ka but E. sibiricum could not. Added to this, the 231 persistently restricted geographical range of *Elasmotherium*, also likely linked to its specialized habitat, as well as low population size and slow reproductive rate associated with large body size<sup>58</sup>, 232 233 would have predisposed it to extinction in the face of environmental change, while the ecologically 234 similar, but much smaller species (S. tatarica) survived. The extinction of E. sibiricum could in theory 235 have been exacerbated by human hunting pressure, given the replacement of H. neanderthalensis by *H. sapiens* in Eurasia ca. 45-40 ka<sup>59</sup>. There is currently no record of the species' remains from any 236 archaeological site, and the very few suggested depictions of Elasmotherium in Palaeolithic art (ref. 237 <sup>51</sup>; ref.<sup>2</sup>, p. 46-7) are unconvincing. 238

#### 239 Materials and Methods

We sampled a total of 25 specimens of *E. sibiricum* from the collections of the Museum of the Institute of Plant
and Animal Ecology UB RAS (Ekaterinburg), Sverdlovsk Regional History Museum (Ekaterinburg), Zoological
Institute RAS (St Petersburg) and the Natural History Museum (London). Specimens were readily identified
from the highly characteristic features of the skull, mandible, postcranial bones, and the hypsodont, rootless
cheek teeth with their distinctive convoluted enamel. Sample provenances are detailed in the Supplementary
Information.

246 At the Groningen Centre for Isotope Research (CIO), samples underwent standard chemical cleaning and collagen extraction following an improved version of the Longin method, as described in ref.<sup>60</sup> and in the 247 248 Supplementary Information. In short, bone samples are decalcified over at least 24 hrs using weak HCI (4% 249 w/vol). When CO<sub>2</sub> release has ceased and the fragments are soft and pliable they are rinsed thoroughly with 250 distilled water (DW). The extract is exposed to NaOH (1%, >30 min) to eliminate humic acids, rinsed to 251 neutrality and again treated with HCI (4% w/vol, 15 min). The raw collagen fraction is denatured to gelatin in 252 acidified DW (pH 3) at 90 °C for 18 hrs. Dissolved gelatin is filtered through a 100 μm mesh to eliminate any 253 remaining foreign particulates, and dried. The collagen is combusted to CO<sub>2</sub> using an Elemental Analyser (Isocube) connected to an Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometer (Isoprime), providing stable isotope ratios <sup>13</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C 254 and  ${}^{15}N/{}^{14}N$ . For  ${}^{14}C$ , the CO<sub>2</sub> was cryogenically trapped using an automatic collection device. The routine 255

graphitization procedure at the CIO has been operational for over 20 years<sup>61,62</sup>, with only minor, mainly 256 mechanical, adjustments. The  ${}^{14}C/{}^{12}C$  ratio in the graphite was measured by Accelerator Mass Spectrometry<sup>63</sup>. 257 At the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit (ORAU), samples were dated using two different methods. First, 258 259 samples were pre-treated following the routine procedure at the ORAU comprising decalcification in acid, a base wash, re-acidification, gelatinisation and ultrafiltration (coded 'AF'), as described in ref. <sup>64</sup>. Samples that 260 had been preserved with glues, or samples for which we did not have complete knowledge of post-excavation 261 262 history, were also washed with organic solvents (acetone, methanol and chloroform) prior to AF treatment 263 (coded 'AF\*'). Samples were also re-dated using the single amino acid radiocarbon dating method optimised at ORAU<sup>11</sup>. This method involves separation of the underivatised amino acids using preparative High Performance 264 Liquid Chromatography after hydrolysis of the bone collagen samples. Using this method, the amino acid 265 266 hydroxyproline was isolated and then combusted, graphitised and dated by AMS. The sample C/M 12836 was 267 prepared in duplicate as part of an internal control at the ORAU. In both laboratories the quality of the 268 collagen (or hydroxyproline) extracted was monitored by measuring carbon and nitrogen contents (%C and 269 %N) and the atomic ratio of carbon to nitrogen (C:N) that is acceptable in the range 2.9–3.5 in the case of 270 collagen or ~5.0 in the case of hydroxyproline.

271

The <sup>14</sup>C ages were calibrated against the Northern Hemisphere calibration (IntCal13) dataset<sup>17</sup>. Here we used a 272 single 'Phase' model in OxCal 4.3 (ref. <sup>18</sup>) coupled with a 'General' outlier model (probability = 0.05). Using 273 274 Bayes theorem, the algorithms employed sample possible solutions with a probability that is the product of 275 the prior and likelihood probabilities. Taking into account the deposition model and the actual age 276 measurements, the posterior probability densities quantify the most likely age distributions; the 'Outlier' 277 option was used to detect ages that fall outside the calibration model for each group, and if necessary, down-278 weight their contribution to the final age estimates. The 'Phase' command is a grouping model which assumes 279 no geographic relationship between samples and that the ages represent a uniform distribution between a 280 start and end boundary. For the model a start and end boundary is included to bracket the Elasmotherium 281 'phase'. The posterior distributions allow us to determine probability distribution functions (PDF) for the 282 beginning and ending of the phase. Modelled ages are reported here at the 95% probability range in 283 thousands of calendar years BP (cal ka BP; relative to AD 1950). This method has been applied to a wide range of contexts including studies on megafaunal and Neanderthal extinction<sup>35,65</sup>, archaeological phases of 284 occupation and ceramic development<sup>66,67</sup>, and palaeoearthquakes<sup>68</sup>, providing robust age estimates for the 285 start and end of phases, often with fewer <sup>14</sup>C measurements than those reported here. In OxCal, commands 286 287 or parameters are written in a CQL (Command Query Language).

288

The  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values in bone collagen of a herbivorous mammal reflect the isotopic composition of the 289 plant food and water the organism ingested during its life<sup>69</sup>, and these are in turn related to climatic and local 290 291 environmental parameters. The  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{13}$ N values of terrestrial C3 plants are mainly determined by (local) environmental and biogeochemical factors, such as humidity, atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> concentrations, nitrogen 292 293 cycling and nutrient availability<sup>70-72</sup>. The stable carbon and nitrogen isotope concentrations ( $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values) of E. sibiricum bone collagen were measured on CO<sub>2</sub> by Isotope Ratio Mass Spectrometry (IRMS). 294 295 Published comparative data comprised woolly rhinoceros (Coelodonta antiquitatis)<sup>43</sup>, Merck's rhinoceros (Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis) and indeterminate Stephanorhinus specimens (S. kirchbergensis &/or narrow-296 nosed rhinoceros S. hemitoechus)<sup>73</sup>, and saiga antelope (Saiga tatarica)<sup>54</sup>. In the case of C. antiquitatis and S. 297 298 tatarica we plotted only samples from pre-LGM central Asia, for direct comparison with E. sibiricum.

Ancient DNA analyses were performed at the Australian Centre for Ancient DNA, University of Adelaide. DNA was extracted from six *E. sibiricum* samples using a silica-based method<sup>74</sup>. Sequencing libraries were then created from the DNA extracts following the protocol of ref.<sup>75</sup>. We enriched each of the sequencing libraries for mammalian mitochondrial DNA using a previously published set of RNA probes<sup>76</sup> and sequenced them on an Illumina MiSeq. The resulting sequencing reads were mapped to the mitochondrial genome of the extant white rhinoceros - *Ceratotherium simum* - and consensus sequences were generated for each sample using
 Geneious (Biomatters; http://www.geneious.com). Phylogenetic analyses were performed on these data using
 BEAST<sup>77</sup> and RAXML<sup>78</sup>. Additional details can be found in the Supplementary Information.

#### 307 Code availability

- 308 The code used to calibrate the <sup>14</sup>C ages in OxCal is given in the Supplementary Information.
- 309

#### 310 Acknowledgements

311

We thank Pierre-Olivier Antoine for discussion, Juha Saarinen for estimating the body mass of *Elasmotherium*, The Museum of the IPAE UB RAS and Leonid Petrov for providing bone samples for
analysis, Paula Campos for help with stable isotope data, Selina Brace for initial work on ancient
DNA, Willem van der Merwe for permission to reproduce his artwork in Fig. 1A, Igor Doronin for the

- 316 photo in Fig. 1B, the team of the Oxford Radiocarbon Accelerator Unit for AMS dating, and Jonathan
- 317 Hagstrum for an early stimulus to the study. Funding was provided by the Australian Research
- 318 Council and the Natural Environment Research Council, UK (grant no. NE/G005982/1). Part of the
- 319 research received funding from the European Research Council under the European Union's Seventh
- 320 Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) ERC grant 324139 "PalaeoChron" award to Tom Higham.
- 321 The study is partly supported by the programme of the UD RAS, project number 18-4-4-3.
- 322

#### 323 Author contributions

324

PK, TvK, AJS, AL & AC conceived the project. PK, AT & EP provided samples & contextual information. Ancient DNA work and phylogenetic analyses were performed by KJM and coordinated by AC. Radiocarbon data was obtained and analyzed by TH, TD and DC at the ORAU, and by JvdP at Groningen, while CT and TH undertook age modelling. Stable isotope analysis was performed and interpreted by MK, while CT & AJS provided context on climate and extinctions, respectively. All authors contributed to the interpretation of results and writing of the manuscript, which was coordinated by AL.

332

#### 333 Additional Information

- 334
- 335 Supplementary information accompanies this paper at .....
- 336 **Competing Interests:** The authors declare no competing interests.
- **Publisher's note:** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published
   maps and institutional affiliations.
- 339 **Data Availability:** The four mitochondrial genome consensus sequences with coverage ≥80% and
- 340 mean read-depth ≥5× are available on GenBank (MH937513-MH937516). All consensus sequences,
- 341 unmapped sequencing reads, and phylogenetic analysis files associated with our ancient DNA work
- 342 are available on figshare (https://figshare.com/) DOI: 10.25909/5ba34a40ba925. All the radiocarbon
- 343 data generated at the ORAU and at Groningen are archived internally at the respective laboratories
- and are available upon request. ORAU Data is also available on the laboratory's website with link tothe paper.
- 346
- 347

348					
349					
350	References				
351					
352 353	1.	Fortelius, M. <i>New and Old Worlds database of fossil mammals (NOW)</i> . (University of Helsinki, 2017)			
354	2.	Antoine, PO. Phylogénie et Évolution des Elasmotheriina (Mammalia, Rhinocerotidae).			
355		Mem. du Museum Natl. d'Histoire Nat. <b>188,</b> 1–359 (2002).			
356	3.	Becker, D., Antoine, P. O. & Maridet, O. A new genus of rhinocerotidae (Mammalia,			
357		Perissodactyla) from the Oligocene of Europe. J. Syst. Palaeontol. 11, 947–972 (2013).			
358	4.	Cerdeño, E. Cladistic analysis of the family Rhinocerotidae (Perissodactyla). Am. Museum			
359	_	Novit. <b>3143,</b> 1–25 (1995).			
360	5.	Guerin, C. & Pickford, M. Ougandatherium napakense nov. gen. nov. sp., le plus ancien			
361	6	Rhinocerotidae iranotheriinae d'Afrique. <i>Ann. Paleontologie</i> <b>89,</b> 1–35 (2003).			
362	6.	Deng, T. & Zheng, M. Limb bones of Elasmotherium (Rhinocerotidae, Perissodactyla) from			
363	-	Ninewan (Hebel, China). <i>Vertebr. Pal Aslat.</i> <b>43,</b> 110–121 (2005).			
364	7.	Schvyreva, A. K. On the importance of the representatives of the genus Elasmotherium			
365		(Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) in the biochronology of the Pleistocene of Eastern Europe. Quat.			
300	0	IIII. <b>379,</b> 128–134 (2015). Kazamkulava, D.S. Flasmatharium sibirigum und sein Verbreitungsgehiet auf dem			
307	8.	Kozamkulova, B. S. Elasmothenum sibilicum und sein verbreitungsgebiet auf dem			
260	0	Kosintsov, P. A. Elasmothorium sibaricum Eisbar (1909). Now data on the pariod of existence			
270	9.	and goographic range, in The Ougternary of the Urals: Clobal Trends and Pan European			
370		Ougternary Records 67-68 (UrFU 2011)			
371	10	Lister A M & Stuart A L Extinction chronology of the woolly rhinoceros Coelodonta			
372	10.	antiquitatis: Renly to Kuzmin <i>Quaternary Science Reviews</i> 62, 144–146 (2013)			
374	11	Devièse T. Comeskey, D. McCullagh I. Bronk Ramsey, C. & Higham T. New protocol for			
375		compound-specific radiocarbon analysis of archaeological bones. <i>Rapid Commun. Mass</i>			
376		Spectrom. <b>32</b> , 373–379 (2018).			
377	12.	Bourrillon, R. <i>et al.</i> A new Aurignacian engraving from Abri Blanchard. France: Implications for			
378		understanding Aurignacian graphic expression in Western and Central Europe. Quat. Int.			
379		(2017). doi:10.1016/j.quaint.2016.09.063			
380	13.	Devièse, T. <i>et al.</i> Direct dating of Neanderthal remains from the site of Vindija Cave and			
381		implications for the Middle to Upper Paleolithic transition. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U. S. A. 114,			
382		10606–10611 (2017).			
383	14.	Reynolds, N., Dinnis, R., Bessudnov, A. A., Devièse, T. & Higham, T. The Kostënki 18 child			
384		burial and the cultural and funerary landscape of Mid Upper Palaeolithic European Russia.			
385		Antiquity <b>91,</b> 1435–1450 (2017).			
386	15.	Devièse, T. et al. Increasing accuracy for the radiocarbon dating of sites occupied by the first			
387		Americans. <i>Quat. Sci. Rev.</i> <b>198,</b> 171–180 (2018).			
388	16.	Becerra-Valdivia, L. et al. Reassessing the chronology of the archaeological site of Anzick.			
389		Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. (2018). doi:10.1073/pnas.1803624115			
390	17.	Reimer, P. J. et al. IntCal13 and Marine13 Radiocarbon Age Calibration Curves 0–50,000 Years			
391		cal BP. <i>Radiocarbon</i> <b>55,</b> 1869–1887 (2013).			
392	18.	Bronk Ramsey, C. Recent and Planned Developments of the Program OxCal. Radiocarbon 55,			
393		720–730 (2013).			
394	19.	Bronk Ramsey, C. Bayesian analysis of radiocarbon dates. <i>Radiocarbon</i> <b>51</b> , 337–360 (2009).			
395	20.	Kosintsev, P. A. (Ed.) Ural and Siberia faunas at Pleistocene and Holocene Times. (Russian			
396	24	Academy of Science, Urals Division. Institute of Plant and Animal Ecology, 2005).			
397	21.	vasirev, S. A. Faunal exploitation, subsistence practices and Pleistocene extinctions in			
398		Palaeolitnic Sideria. <i>Deinsea</i> <b>9,</b> 513–556 (2003).			

399	22.	Price, S. A. & Bininda-Emonds, O. R. P. A comprehensive phylogeny of extant horses, rhinos
400		and tapirs (Perissodactyla) through data combination. <i>Zoosystematics Evol.</i> 85, 277–292
401		(2009).
402	23.	Steiner, C. C. & Ryder, O. A. Molecular phylogeny and evolution of the Perissodactyla. Zool. J.
403		Linn. Soc. <b>163,</b> 1289–1303 (2011).
404	24.	Meredith, R. W. et al. Impacts of the cretaceous terrestrial revolution and KPg extinction on
405		mammal diversification. Science <b>334,</b> 521–524 (2011).
406	25.	Heissig, K. The American genus Penetrigonias Tanner & Martin, 1976 (Mammalia:
407		Rhinocerotidae) as a stem group elasmothere and ancestor of Menoceras Troxell, 1921.
408		Zitteliana <b>A 52,</b> 79–95 (2012).
409	26.	Boehme, M. et al. Na Duong (northern Vietnam) – an exceptional window into Eocene
410		ecosystems from Southeast Asia. Zitteliana A 53, 120–167 (2013).
411	27.	Shpansky, A. V., Ilyina, S. A. & Aliyasova, V. N. The Quaternary mammals from Kozhamzhar
412		locality (Pavlodar Region, Kazakhstan). Am. J. Appl. Sci. 13, 189–199 (2016).
413	28.	Reimer, P. J. & Svyatko, S. V. Comment on Shpansky et al. 2016, The Quaternary mammals
414		from Kozhamzhar locality (Pavlodar region, Kazakhstan). Am. J. Appl. Sci. 13, 477–478 (2016).
415	29.	Rasmussen, S. O. et al. A stratigraphic framework for abrupt climatic changes during the Last
416		Glacial period based on three synchronized Greenland ice-core records: refining and
417		extending the INTIMATE event stratigraphy. Quat. Sci. Rev. 106, 14–28 (2014).
418	30.	Stuart, A. J. Late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions on the continents: A short review. <i>Geol.</i>
419		<i>J.</i> <b>50,</b> 338–363 (2015).
420	31.	Stuart, A. J. & Lister, A. M. Patterns of Late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions in Europe and
421		northern Asia. Cour. Forschungsinstitut Senckenb. <b>259.</b> 289–299 (2007).
422	32.	Cooper, A. <i>et al.</i> Abrupt warming events drove Late Pleistocene Holarctic megafaunal
423	-	turnover. <i>Science</i> <b>349.</b> 602–606 (2015).
424	33.	Hughes, P. D. & Gibbard, P. L. A stratigraphical basis for the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM).
425		<i>Ougt. Int.</i> <b>383.</b> 174–185 (2015).
426	34.	Monegato, G., Scardia, G., Haidas, I., Rizzini, F. & Piccin, A. The Alpine LGM in the boreal ice-
427	-	sheets game. <i>Sci. Rep.</i> <b>7</b> . 2078 (2017).
428	35.	Higham, T. <i>et al.</i> The timing and spatiotemporal patterning of Neanderthal disappearance.
429	001	Nature <b>512</b> , 306–309 (2014).
430	36.	Heintzman, P. D. <i>et al.</i> A new genus of horse from pleistocene North America. <i>Elife</i> (2017).
431	001	doi:10.7554/el ife 29944
432	37	Stuart A I & Lister A M Extinction chronology of the woolly rhinoceros Coelodonta
433	571	antiquitatis in the context of late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions in northern Eurasia
434		Quaternary Science Reviews <b>51</b> , 1–17 (2012)
435	38	Stuart A I & Lister A M New radiocarbon evidence on the extirnation of the spotted
436	50.	hvaena (Crocuta crocuta (Erxl.)) in northern Eurasia. <i>Quat. Sci. Rev.</i> <b>96</b> , 108–116 (2014)
437	39	Dinnis R. Pate A & Revnolds N. Mid-to-late Marine Isotone Stage 3 mammal faunas of
438	55.	Britain: a new look Proc Geol Assoc <b>127</b> 435–444 (2016)
439	40	Pacher, M. & Stuart, A. J. Extinction chronology and nalaeobiology of the cave bear (Ursus
440	101	spelaeus) Boregs <b>38</b> 189–206 (2009)
лл1	/11	Bocherens, H. et al. The last of its kind? Radiocarbon, ancient DNA and stable isotone
441 AA2	41.	evidence from a late cave bear (Ursus spelaeus ROSENMÜLLER, 1794) from Rochedane
112		(France) $Ougt Int 320-240 170-188 (2014)$
74J 777	12	Stuart A. L. Kosintsey, D. A. Higham, T. & Lister, A. M. Pleistosene to Holosene extinction
 //5	42.	dynamics in giant deer and woolly mammoth <i>Mature</i> <b>121</b> 694–690 (2004)
445	13	Stuart A. I. & Lister A. M. Extinction chronology of the weelly rhineseres Cooledonta
440	43.	antiquitatis in the context of late Quaternary magafaunal extinctions in porthers Eurosia
447 110		antiquitatis in the context of face Quaternary megalaunal extinctions in northern Eurosia. $O_{\rm V}$ of the second secon
440 440	44	Qualer nur y Science Reviews 31, 1-17 (2012). Guillouis M. et al. Evidence for a three phase convence during heinrich stadial Ausian a
449	44.	Sumevic, ivi. et al. Evidence for a three-phase sequence during heimrich stadial 4 using a

450		multiproxy approach based on Greenland ice core records. Clim. Past 10, 2115–2133 (2014).
451	45.	Hubberten, H. W. et al. The periglacial climate and environment in northern Eurasia during
452		the Last Glaciation. <i>Quat. Sci. Rev.</i> <b>23,</b> 1333–1357 (2004).
453	46.	Boeskorov, G. G. et al. Woolly rhino discovery in the lower Kolyma River. Quat. Sci. Rev. 30,
454		2262–2272 (2011).
455	47.	Rivals, F. & Lister, A. M. Dietary flexibility and niche partitioning of large herbivores through
456		the Pleistocene of Britain. <i>Quat. Sci. Rev.</i> <b>146.</b> 116–133 (2016).
457	48.	Saarinen, J., Fronen, J., Fortelius, M., Seppä, H. & Lister, A. M. Patterns of diet and body mass
458		of large ungulates from the Pleistocene of Western Europe, and their relation to vegetation.
459		Palaeontol Electron <b>19</b> , 1–58 (2016)
460	49	Pushkina D. Bocherens H & Ziegler R. Unexpected palaeoecological features of the Middle
461	131	and Late Pleistocene large herbivores in southwestern Germany revealed by stable isotonic
462		abundances in tooth enamel <i>Quat Int</i> <b>339–340</b> , 164–178 (2014)
463	50	Zeuner E E New reconstructions of the woolly rhinoceros and Merck's rhinoceros Proc
464	50.	Linn Soc London <b>156</b> 183–195 (1945)
465	51	Zhegallo, V. <i>et al.</i> On the fossil rhinoceros Elasmotherium (including the collections of the
465	51.	Russian Academy of Sciences) Cranium 22 17–40 (2005)
400	52	Grichuk V. P. Vegetation in the Late Pleistocene in Dynamics of terrestrial landscane
407	52.	components and inner marine basins of Northern Furasia during the last 130,000 years led
400		Velichko A A) $64-88$ (GEOS Publishers 2002)
405	52	Bocherens, H. Isotonic higgeochemistry and the naleoecology of the mammoth stenne fauna
470	55.	Deinceg 9 57–76 (2003)
471	54	liggensen 1 et al. Diet and habitat of the saiga antelone during the late Quaternary using
472	54.	stable carbon and nitrogen isotone ratios. <i>Quat. Sci. Rev.</i> <b>160</b> , 150–161 (2017)
473	55	Badeck E-W. Tcharkez G. Nogués S. Diel C. & Ghashghaje I. Dost-nhotosynthetic
474	55.	fractionation of stable carbon isotones between plant organs—a widespread phenomenon
475		Panid Commun Mass Spectrom <b>10</b> 1291–1201 (2005)
470	56	Drucker, G. et al. Tracking possible decline of woolly mammath during the Gravettian in
477	50.	Dordogno (Eranço) and the Ach Valley (Cormany) using multi isotopo tracking (120, 140
470		15N 24S 18O) Ougt Int <b>360</b> 204–217 (2015)
479	57	Druckar D. G. Bacharans H. & Páan S. Isotopos stables (120 15N) du collagàna dos
400	57.	mammauths de Mozhyrich (Enigravettion, Elkraine): Implications palégéologiques
401		Anthropol 119 504–517 (2014)
40Z 102	EO	Anunopol. 110, 504–517 (2014).
405 101	56.	joinison, c. N. Determinants of loss of maininal species during the Late Quaternal y
404 105		
405	50	2221-2227 (2009). Higham T. Dauka K. Waad B. Drank Damcay C. Drack F. The timing and enstitatemporal
400	59.	nightin, T., Douka, K., Woou, K., Bronk Kanisey, C., Brock, F. The timing and spatiotemporal
407 100	60	Mook W. G. & Strourman, H. J. Dhycical and chemical aspects of radiosarbon dating in 14C
400	60.	and Archaeology (ad Mack W.C. Waterbelk, H.T.) 21, 55 (1082)
409	61	Wiima S. Aarts A. T. van der Dlicht J. & Zondervan A. The Groningen AMS facility Aug
490	01.	Wijind, S., Aerts, A. T., Van der Pilcit, J. & Zondervan, A. The Groningen Aivis facility. Nucl.
491		Instruments Methous Phys. Res. Sect. B Beam Interact. With Mater. Atoms <b>113,</b> 405–409
492	<b>C</b> 2	(1990).
493	02.	Aerts-Bijfild, A. T., Meijer, H. A. J. & Vall der Plicht, J. Alvis Sample handling in Groningen. <i>Nucl.</i>
494		Instruments Methods Phys. Res. Sect. B Beam Interact. With Mater. Atoms <b>123,</b> 221–225
495	6.2	
496	63.	van Der Plicht, J., Wijma, S., Aerts, A. L., Pertuisot, M. H. & Meijer, H. A. J. Status report: The
497		Groningen AIVIS facility. <i>Nucl. Instruments Mietnoas Phys. Res. Sect. B Beam Interact. with</i>
498	<i>C A</i>	Water. Atoms 1/2, 58–65 (2000).
499	64.	Brock, F., Higham, I., Ditchtield, P. & Ramsey, C. B. Current pretreatment methods for ams
500		radiocarbon dating at the oxford radiocarbon accelerator unit (UKAU). Radiocarbon 52, 103–

501		112 (2010).	
502	65.	Metcalf, J. L. et al. Synergistic roles of climate warming and human occupation in Patagonian	
503		megafaunal extinctions during the Last Deglaciation. Sci. Adv. 2, e1501682–e1501682 (2016).	
504	66.	Turney, C. S. M., Jones, R. T., Thomas, Z. A., Palmer, J. G. & Brown, D. Extreme wet conditions	
505		coincident with Bronze Age abandonment of upland areas in Britain. Anthropocene 13, 69–79	
506		(2016).	
507	67.	Finkelstein, I. & Piasetzky, E. Radiocarbon dating the Iron Age in the Levant: A Bayesian model	
508		for six ceramic phases and six transitions. Antiquity 84, 374–385 (2010).	
509	68.	Lienkaemper, J. J. & Ramsey, C. B. OxCal: Versatile Tool for Developing Paleoearthquake	
510		ChronologiesA Primer. <i>Seismol. Res. Lett.</i> <b>80,</b> 431–434 (2009).	
511	69.	Kohn, M. J. You are what you eat. <i>Science <b>283,</b></i> 335–6 (1999).	
512	70.	Szpak, P. Complexities of nitrogen isotope biogeochemistry in plant-soil systems: implications	
513		for the study of ancient agricultural and animal management practices. Front. Plant Sci. 5,	
514		288 (2014).	
515	71.	Nadelhoffer, K. et al. 15N natural abundances and N use by tundra plants. Oecologia 107,	
516		386–394 (1996).	
517	72.	Michener, R. & Lajtha, K. Stable Isotopes in Ecology and Environmental Science. (Blackwell,	
518		2007).	
519	73.	Kuitems, M. et al. Carbon and nitrogen stable isotopes of well-preserved, Middle Pleistocene	
520		bone collagen from Schöningen (Germany) and their palaeoecological implications. J. Hum.	
521		<i>Evol.</i> <b>89,</b> 105–113 (2015).	
522	74.	Brotherton, P. et al. Neolithic mitochondrial haplogroup H genomes and the genetic origins of	
523		Europeans. Nat. Commun. 4, 1764 (2013).	
524	75.	Meyer, M. & Kircher, M. Illumina sequencing library preparation for highly multiplexed target	
525		capture and sequencing. Cold Spring Harb. Protoc. 5, pdb.prot5448 (2010).	
526	76.	Mitchell, K. J. et al. Ancient mitochondrial DNA reveals convergent evolution of giant short-	
527		faced bears (Tremarctinae) in North and South America. Biol. Lett. 12, 20160062 (2016).	
528	77.	Drummond, A. J. & Rambaut, A. BEAST: Bayesian evolutionary analysis by sampling trees.	
529		BMC Evol. Biol. <b>7,</b> 214 (2007).	
530	78.	Stamatakis, A. RAxML version 8: A tool for phylogenetic analysis and post-analysis of large	
531		phylogenies. Bioinformatics <b>30,</b> 1312–1313 (2014).	
532	79.	Van der Merwe, W. S. Elasmotherium caucasicum. Deviant Art (2018). Available at:	
533		https://www.deviantart.com/willemsvdmerwe/.	
534	80.	Rohling, E. J. et al. New constraints on the timing of sea level fluctuations during early to	
535		middle marine isotope stage 3. <i>Paleoceanography</i> <b>23,</b> n/a-n/a (2008).	
536	81.	Ehlers, J. & Gibbard, P. L. Quaternary glaciations: extent and chronology. Parts 1-3. in	
537		Developments in Quaternary Science 2 (Elsevier).	
538	82.	Andersen, K. K. et al. The Greenland Ice Core Chronology 2005, 15–42 ka. Part 1: constructing	
539		the time scale. <i>Quat. Sci. Rev.</i> <b>25,</b> 3246–3257 (2006).	
540			
541			
542	Figure	Captions	
543	Figure	1: (A) Artist's impression of <i>Elasmotherium</i> in life (from ref <sup>79</sup> ). (B) Mounted skeleton of <i>E.</i>	
544	sibiricum from Gaevskaja Village near Stavropol, south-west Russia, on display in the Stavropol		
545	Museum (length of skeleton approximately 410 cm, height 250 cm; photo by Dr. Igor Doronin).		
546	Figure	2: Map of distribution and samples analysed. Dashed line: total range of specimens referred	
547	to <i>E</i> sibiricum <sup>7,8</sup> Red circles: samples producing radiocarbon and stable isotone data. Blue circles:		
547			

- samples producing radiocarbon, stable isotope and DNA sequence data. Black circles: no collagen.
- 549 Note: there are fewer mapped points than actual samples analysed, because of multiple samples

- from some localities. Map shows ice sheets (grey shading) and bathymetry for MIS 3 (from refs.
   <sup>43,80,81</sup>).
- 552 Figure 3: Plot of calibrated ages for *E. sibiricum* (calibrated with IntCal13 in OxCal v4.3). Median ages
- are represented as vertical black lines with 95.4% confidence limits as associated grey bars (HYP
- dates in darker grey). The blue bar represents our estimate (95.4% posterior distribution) for the last
- appearance of *Elasmotherium* as derived from our Phase model. The NGRIP  $\delta^{18}$ O Greenland ice core
- record is shown as a proxy for temperature (more positive values representing warmer
- temperatures). The maximum counting error reported for the Greenland timescale (GICC05) is
- 558 considered to approximate the  $2\sigma$  uncertainty<sup>82</sup>; for the start of S5 (GS-5.1), this is 1008 years<sup>29</sup>.
- 559 Greenland stadials (S1 to S8) and interstadials (I1 to I8) are indicated.
- 560 Figure 4: Maximum clade credibility tree of rhinoceroses and selected outgroup perissodactyls
- resulting from our time-calibrated BEAST analyses. Scale is in millions of years before the present.
- 562 Node heights represent mean age estimates, while node bars represent 95% Highest Posterior
- 563 Densities (HPDs). Branch support values (BEAST posterior probability / maximum likelihood
- bootstrap %) are presented in black text for nodes that received less than unequivocal support (i.e.
- 565 1.0 / 100).
- Figure 5: Stable carbon ( $\delta^{13}$ C) and nitrogen ( $\delta^{15}$ N) values of *Elasmotherium sibiricum* samples, compared to those of Late Pleistocene woolly rhinoceros (*Coelodonta antiquitatis*<sup>43</sup>), Middle Pleistocene Merck's rhinoceros (*Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis*<sup>73</sup>) and/or narrow-nosed rhinoceros (*Stephanorhinus hemitoechus*<sup>73</sup>) and Late Pleistocene saiga antelope (*Saiga tatarica*<sup>54</sup>). *Coelodonta* and *Saiga* data are restricted to the spatio-temporal extent of our *E. sibiricum* samples.
- 571









